EXHIBIT 1

In The Matter Of:

Scott Ballock v.
Ellen Ruth Costlow, et al

Scott Ballock April 19, 2019

Sapphire Court Reporting LLC
204 Oak Drive
Clarksburg, WV 26301
304-476-7553
www.SapphireCR.com

Original File Scott T. Ballock.txt
Min-U-Script® with Word Index

14 counter-intelligence matters. 1 So, I want to make sure I understand. You were 2 3 at the Ann Arbor resident agency, but that falls under the Detroit field office? 4 Α. Correct. 5 So you didn't actually work physically at 6 Q. 7 Detroit; you were physically at Ann Arbor? My office was in Ann Arbor. 8 Α. Okay. 9 Q. 10 A. Yeah. 11 So, am I correct then that, basically, your job Q. 12 duties as a special agent, speaking generally, were investing crimes, apprehending suspects --13 14 A. Correct. 15 -- making arrests? Q. 16 Α. Yes. 17 Anything else that I'm missing? I mean, my Q. 18 knowledge of the FBI comes from TV and movies. 19 Developing informants, working with the CIA to 20 develop informants to work against terrorists overseas. 21 Where did you go after Ann Arbor? 0. 22 Α. I was promoted to supervisory special agent at 23 CJIS in Clarksburg, West Virginia. I started there in August of 2011. 24 25 Was that your first supervisory position? Q.

17 Jeff Lindsey went. So, first him, and then Soo Barrow. 1 Yeah. 2 Did you work anywhere after that? 3 Q. A. No. 4 When were you and Ellen Costlow married? 5 · Q. June of 1990 -- 1991? 1991. 6 Α. 7 Where were you married? Q. Bloomington, Indiana. 8 A. 9 Was that your first marriage? Q. 10 Α. Yes. Was it hers? 11 Q. 12 Α. Yes. 13 I believe you said you have two children; Q. 14 correct? 15 Α. Yeah. 16 Summer and Tommy? Q. 17 Α. Correct. 18 Q. What are their ages? 19 Α. Summer is now 15. She'll be 16 in three weeks, 20 less than three weeks. And Tommy is 18. 21 Now, I understand from reviewing the file here 22 that at some point in your marriage Ellen began seeing 23 other men; is that correct? 24 A. Correct. 25 Q. When did that begin?

18 1 When we were assigned to Indianapolis division. A. 2 Q. Do you know what year? 2003. 3 A. Were you aware that she was seeing other men? 4 Q. 5 Α. Yes. How did she meet these men? 6 Q. 7 A. Online and in person. В When you say online, how did she meet them 0. online? 9 10 A. Craigslist. 11 Q. Any other methods or websites she used? 12 Yeah. Yes, that's the website she used. A. I 13 don't know of any others. 14 Q. Okay. All right. I'm sorry I wasn't clear 15 there. 16 You said she met them online and in person. Would she first make contact with them through 17 18 Craigslist? 19 A. Uh-huh. 20 I need a verbal answer. Q. 21 A. Oh, I'm sorry. You're right. Yes. 22 Q. And then she would arrange an in-person 23 meeting; is that correct? 24 Α. Yes. 25 Q. Okay. Did you ever post ads on Craigslist for

20 1 something was up? 2 A. Yeah. Did you ask her are you seeing other men or did 3 you just ask her, you know, generally, what's up, why 4 are you so distant or --5 6 A. I don't recall specifically, but probably are 7 you seeing other men. 8 0. Okay. And then she confessed to you that she was soliciting men through Craigslist? 9 A. 10 Yes. 11 Q. And you, at that point, did not divorce her; 12 correct? 13 A. Correct. 14 Q. And she continued to see men on Craigslist or 15 through Craigslist after you confronted her; correct? 16 Α. Correct. 17 Did you record any of her encounters with these other men on video? 18 19 A. No. 20 Did anyone record the encounters? Q. 21 She did. Α. 22 Q. Anyone else? 23 Not that -- not that I'm aware of. A. 24 Q. Did you watch videos of your wife having sex with other men? 25

1 Α. Yes. How often? 2 Q. Not very often, just to confirm that it was 3 4 happening. 5 Q. Did you ever have sexual relations with anyone else while you and Ellen were married? 6 A. 7 No. 8 So, kind of the crux of this matter, what led 9 to us being here today was after you two -- the four of 10 you moved here to Morgantown, the transfer to CJIS, Ellen began seeing a man called Kenny Ice; correct? 11 12 Α. Kenny Ice, Jr; correct. 13 When did you become aware that Ellen was seeing Q. 14 Kenny Ice? And I'll just refer to him as Kenny Ice, but 15 you're correct there's Kenny Ice Junior and Senior, and 16 she was seeing the junior. So when did you become aware 17 that she was seeing Kenny Ice? 18 Α. In the summer of 2011. 19 How did you learn that? Q. 20 A. She told me about it. 21 Why did she tell you? Q. 22 Because she said if we couldn't get things A. 23 straightened out that she was going to leave me for him. 24 Q. So I take it you two were having some marital 25 problems at that point?

A. Yes.

- Q. What kind of marital problems?
- A. She has mental disorders, and she was very moody and violent and difficult. It was like walking on egg shells around her. She -- for her part, I didn't give her the attention that she wanted. All my attention was focused on the children. Instead of having date nights, I would insist that whatever we did recreationally or vacation-wise was with the children. I neglected her emotional needs.
- Q. Okay. Now, so you said that you first became aware that she was seeing Kenny Ice in the summer of 2011?
 - A. Yes.
- Q. And you guys didn't separate until September 2012; is that correct?
- A. So then I need to make a correction. She met him in the summer of 2012, about June. You're correct. We moved to West Virginia in 2011. A year -- almost a year later, in June 2012, is when she met Kenny Ice, Jr., and we were separated, that's correct, in September of 2012.
- Q. Now, if she had been seeing other men since
 2003 -- so at this point it would have been nine years
 -- why was it an issue when she began seeing Kenny Ice?

24 1 Q. So, September 2012, you and Ellen separate? A. Uh-huh. 2 She -- am I correct that she stayed in the 3 Q. house at 51 Summit Overlook? 4 5 A. Yes. And where did you live? 6 0. I moved to an apartment in downtown Morgantown. 7 Α. Do you know the address? 8 Q. I do not. 9 A. Who filed for divorce? 10 Q. She filed for divorce. 11 A. 12 Q. Do you know when that was? Around September 2012. 13 Α. So shortly after you separated? 14 Q. Yes, very shortly. Maybe October 2012, but 15 Α. 16 shortly. 17 Q. Approximation is good enough. Okay. 18 Α. (Deposition Exhibit No. 1 was marked for 19 20 identification.) Mr. Ballock, I've handed you what's been marked 21 Q. as Exhibit 1. 22 23 Α. Yes. I'll represent to you that we got this from the 24 Q. -- we requested and received the prosecuting attorney's 25

A. No.

Q. So you sent her 12 more texts over the next 12 minutes. And then at the bottom of the page, about four lines up at 12:20, she again says, "Please stop texting me." And if you follow along, you'll see that you responded by sending three more texts over the next two minutes.

Then again, going to the third page, at 12:22 and 12:23, she again texts, "Stop texting me please."

At 12:23, "Please leave me alone now." You then sent 23 more texts. So between the time that she first asked you to stop texting her at 12:02 and the end of the day, you sent a total of 38 text messages after she asked you to stop. Why?

- A. Because I was emotionally distraught.
- Q. You would agree with me that you made contact with her using a cell phone after she asked you to stop?
 - A. Yes.
- Q. At 1:45, about midway down the third page, one of the texts you sent her after she'd asked you repeatedly to stop was, "But I see it spiraling out of control. I see the cliff fast approaching for us all and I want to save us."
 - A. Can you repeat that?
 - Q. Sure. 1:45 p.m., about halfway down the page.

- A. Because of email correspondence between Kief and Ellen and because of some circumstantial evidence against Berry and because Kenny Ice told me that -- Kenny Ice, Jr., told me that Berry was having a sexual relationship with Ellen.
- Q. I'll go to the allegations about Trooper Berry and Kenny Ice later, but what email or emails between Sergeant Kief or now Lieutenant Kief and Ellen led you to believe that the troopers had a vested interest in assisting her?
- A. For one, before my misdemeanor trial, I approached the family court and asked for the unsealing of Christi Cooper-Lehki's report and testimony for use in my defense. Gabrielle Mucciola, I believe her name is, assistant prosecutor showed up and represented Ellen at that hearing and argued against its release.

The judge ultimately decided that he wasn't going to release it based upon her comments and because he thought it would be too embarrassing to Ellen. In emails between Kief and Ellen, Kief writes Ellen something to the effect of -- 'cause Ellen, obviously, had shared with him this information. And Kief writes to Ellen, "Wow. That's fantastic. That's great. I bet Scott was humiliated and walked out of the courtroom with his tail between his legs." So Kief, who is

supposed to be an unbiased law enforcement officer who represents citizens as a whole, not just one person, was taking sides with the complainant and very unprofessionally and improperly communicating with her on his official government account about how happy he was that I was humiliated and how happy he was that potentially exculpatory evidence was going to be kept out of my case.

- Q. Just so I'm clear. In the email from Kief to Ellen he was describing the hearing where Gabe Mucciola argues against releasing the Cooper-Lehki report?
- A. Yeah. That was what he was referring to, I bet Scott walked out of that courtroom with his tail between his legs. That's great news. I bet he was humiliated.
 - Q. That was Ellen saying those --
- A. No. That was your Sergeant Kief saying those statements, a law enforcement officer saying those statements.
 - Q. But you testified earlier --
- A. So he wasn't just -- so he wasn't just concerned about the law or justice prevailing. He was concerned and happy that someone was being humiliated and that someone would not be able to use exculpatory information to their benefit.
 - Q. Where did you get that email? Was that

109 1 correct? 2 Α. Yes. Without going into any details about the actual 3 discussion that occurred, is it fair to say that you 4 5 discussed this agreement with your counsel before you signed it? 6 7 A. Yes. Looking on the second page, the first paragraph 8 Q. 9 of the agreement. "Scott Ballock acknowledges that probable cause existed for West Virginia State Police to 10 11 file for the issuance of the warrants in this case 12 pursuant to West Virginia Code Section 61-3C-14a and 13 Section 61-2-9a." Did Corporal Gaskins have probable 14 cause to charge you with those violations? 15 I don't believe he did. Α. 16 Q. You signed at the bottom of this agreeing that he did. 17 Did you submit a false statement to the 18 magistrate court? 19 In that regard, yes. Α. 20 Q. Now, as an FBI agent investigating crimes, you 21 understood what probable cause meant; correct? 22 Α. Yes. It's a very low standard. 23 And when you would investigate cases, you would 24 gather the evidence and present it to a U.S. Attorney;

25

correct?

get me that she didn't want to see her boys face a civil suit, and she believed that this would preclude me from filing a civil suit.

- Q. Any other reasons why you knowingly submitted a false statement to the magistrate?
- A. No. Everybody knew that probable cause didn't exist. Marcia did. My attorney did. I believe Ellen did.
- Q. And you would agree with me that the magistrate found probable cause and issued a warrant for your arrest; correct?
 - A. Yeah. Sure. That's pretty easy.
- Q. Let's refer back to your timeline for a minute.

 Page 8 on your entry for May 21st, 2013, "Kenny Ice
 interviews begin."
 - A. Yes.

- Q. That's the day you first spoke to Kenny Ice?
- A. I think so.
 - Q. It says here in your timeline that Mr. Ice revealed that Ellen was having a sexual affair with West Virginia State Police Trooper Chris Berry, that Ellen and Berry were working to have you arrested so that you would lose your job and so that Ellen would win custody of the children and lifetime alimony payments.
 - A. Yes.

Berry and that he was going to arrest me, I was unconcerned because I didn't think I was doing anything wrong.

I didn't document it. I didn't document a lot of things that he told me. I had a busy life. I was a single parent. I was raising my two children. I work. I didn't document everything he told me.

- Q. As I understand it, you allege that there were some text messages between Trooper Berry and Ellen; is that correct?
 - A. According to Kenny Ice, Jr.
- Q. Did you see the text messages?
- A. I did not. Kenny Ice, Jr. said they were of a personal nature, highly inappropriate messages between a law enforcement officer and Ellen, someone that was already in a relationship with him.

There was one message along the lines of what should I bring over for lunch. This caused a fight -- or maybe what should I get for lunch. I don't know which one sent it. It caused a fight between Ellen and Kenny which resulted in deputies being called out to the house.

- Q. But you did not actually see those text messages?
 - A. I did not. They were sent at a time when Berry

116 was apparently off duty. 1 Okay. And so what exactly did Mr. Ice tell you 2 about Trooper Berry and Ellen? 3 That they were having a relationship. 4 A. Sexual relationship? 5 Q. Sexual relationship, yes, and that it was clear 6 Α. from the email -- from the text messages. 7 It was clear to him? 8 Q. Yeah, clear to him. Α. 9 When did he say this affair began or this 10 Q. relationship began? 11 12 Α. I didn't -- I don't think I asked that and I don't know he told me. 13 How long did the relationship last? 14 Q. I don't know the answer to that. 15 Α. 16 Q. How did Trooper Berry and Ellen meet? I don't know the answer to that. 17 Α. Where would they meet to have sex? 18 Q. I don't have the answer to that. 19 A. 20 Kenny Ice didn't provide you with any of this Q. 21 information? 22 A. No. What I can't understand, Mr. Ballock, Ellen had 23 Q. 24 been seeing other men with your knowledge since approximately 2003. So, at this point, for ten years. 25

The two of you were separated and in the process of getting a divorce. She was dating Kenny Ice, had been dating him for a year at this point. If she was having an affair with Trooper Berry, why would you care?

- A. I didn't care. I couldn't care less. The reason he told me was because it's what started a fight.
 - Q. Between him and --

- A. Between them. I cared only in that he also said they were trying to find a way to arrest me.
 - Q. What specifically did he tell you about that?
- A. Just that they were trying to find a way to arrest me.
 - Q. Did he tell you why he believed that?
 - A. So that I would lose my job.
 - Q. But, I mean, why did he believe that they were trying to find a way to arrest you?
 - A. I don't know. He was -- he was coy in a lot of things. He, again, would parse out information, increasingly damaging information. In fact, he once told me I have one thing that I'm not even telling you that would send Ellen to jail and she'd never see her kids again, but I'm waiting to see how you treat me through all this.
 - Q. That's what Kenny Ice told you?
 - A. Yeah.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Q.

123 immediately after it happened. But then I wanted to write this up some time later and said remember that, tell me again what happened. Okay. Why did your father contact Sergeant Kief about allegations that his soon-to-be-ex-daughter-in-law was seeing a state trooper? My dad said that he did that to protect Trooper A. Berry, actually, because Ellen had sexual relations with men and would then go tell their wives about the relationship. And he said that he was trying to help Berry avoid the same fate. Q. Now, there's no mention in here that your father asked Sergeant Kief to file a formal complaint against Trooper Berry, is there? A. No. Did your father tell you that he asked Sergeant Kief to file -- that he wanted to file a formal complaint against Trooper Berry? I don't think he did. I think, again, I think he was calling just to give a heads-up. Let's go back to your timeline. 0. MR. WILLIAMS: Take a break? MR. JEFFRIES: Let me finish this up.

Let's go to page 12. Are you there?

interview more than just the complainant. Everyone knows that.

This is a good one. The third paragraph, the victim went on displaying that the accused would cut his toenails short, to the point where they would bleed and make a comment it was a relief. She accused me of being a cutter. She told the -- I have no idea how she came up with that. That was pretty fantastical. She told the psychiatrist that I was a cutter and therefore I was dangerous.

I was going through, obviously, the most difficult time of my life, and she, in response to that, had me roll up my pant legs and my sleeves to see that I have no scars. I'm not a cutter. I don't know why she -- she would have said those things.

Well, I do know why. She was trying to make me out to be a monster. It fit within her narrative.

That's a lie. But, again, as you say, he wrote, "The victim."

Q. So --

- A. But, again, that's why you talk to other people. You don't just talk to just the complainant unless you're trying to accomplish an objective.
- Q. You would agree with me then that nearly everything that you've characterized as a lie was

related to -- it even explicitly says in the report that Ellen told Corporal Gaskins that.

A. Correct.

- Q. Would you agree that on the two or three occasions you pointed out where he did not actually say -- you know, preface the statement with "the victim advised," would you agree that if you read in context he's just relaying what she told him?
 - A. Yeah.
- Q. In Paragraph 216 of your complaint it says
 "When he prepared the report, Gaskins knew or should
 have known that the statements provided to him by
 Costlow were false." I'd like to break that down. Why
 do you think Corporal Gaskins actually knew the
 statements were false?
- A. Because I believe that they worked in concert with Ellen to affect my arrest at family court to advantage Ellen and disadvantage me based upon all the other evidence. And, at minimum, he should have known because he should have interviewed more than the complainant, especially in a divorce case. Everyone knows that that's where false allegations are routinely made. It's unbelievable.
 - Q. I don't want to interrupt you. Are you done?
 - A. I'm done.

139 I did not. 1 A. You stated in the complaint, specifically in 2 Paragraphs 139 and 140, that Ellen is a, quote, 3 "skillful liar." Why should Corporal Gaskins have known 4 that her statements were false especially when she had 5 6 your own emails to back a lot of them up? Because had he done his job properly and 7 Α. professionally, he would have -- and had he not been 8 trying to serve another objective, he would have interviewed more than the complainant. 10 So you just believe he didn't conduct an 11 Q. 12 adequate investigation? 13 A. On purpose. Who was this report provided to? 14 Q. Which report? 15 A. The incident report? 16 Q. Who was it provided to? 17 A. Yes. 18 Q. I don't understand the question. They created 19 A. it for their --20 21 0. Do you know who read this report? Who read it? 22 A. Yes. 23 Q.

I have no idea who all read it.

Do you know if it was provided to anyone

24

25

A.

Q.

140 outside of the criminal proceedings? 1 I don't know. But I wouldn't be surprised if 2 Christi Cooper-Lehki received it as part of her 3 investigation. I don't know. 4 Between the time that you were arrested in 5 September 2013 and the time that the charges against you 6 were dismissed in April 2016, you didn't have any 7 contact with Sergeant Kief, did you? 8 A. No. 9 During that same timeframe, did you have any 10 11 contact with Sergeant Gaskins? 12 A. No. During that same timeframe between your arrest 13 and the dismissal of the charges, did you have any 14 contact with Trooper Berry? 15 16 A. No. Did any of the troopers, my clients, ever offer 17 Q. to drop the criminal charges against you? 18 Your clients? 19 Α. 20 Q. Yes. 21 A. No. Did Ellen ever offer to drop the charges 22 Q. against you? 23 Through the assistant prosecutor. 24 A.

Which assistant prosecutor?

25

Q.

142 my father remove a website that he had created which had 1 2 Ellen on it. Benninger --0. Which one? 3 A. I don't know what it is. Benninger called my 4 5 dad into his office and me, told us of Cindy Scott's proposal. And my dad refused, so Benninger threw him 6 7 out of the office. You don't know the name of the website that 8 0. Cindy Scott wanted removed? 10 Α. No. 11 0. So Ellen continued to prosecute the case until 12 it was eventually dismissed? 13 Α, Yes. 14 Q. Was Trooper Berry involved in your criminal prosecution at all? 15 16 Α. I don't know. 17 Did he ever appear at any of the hearings Q. 18 related to the criminal charges? 19 Not that I'm aware. Α. 20 How did my clients, Lieutenant Kief, Sergeant 21 Gaskins, and Trooper Berry, how did they abuse the 22 criminal process? 23 Α. By working with Ellen to have me arrested at family court to advantage her and disadvantage me. 24 25 And --Q.

completely unnecessary.

- Q. Any other evidence?
- A. Not that I can think of right now.
- Q. Do you have any evidence that -- strike that.

 What outrageous acts did Sergeant Kief commit?
- A. I've explained some of them. Shall I explain them again?
- Q. Yes. If you could -- I mean, if you've already referred to them, just point me back to earlier testimony. But what specifically did he do that you believe is outrageous?
- A. Specifically he invited Ellen to circumvent the judge's order. And, through him, provide the FBI with disparaging information. He thought he was being pretty clever there.

He obviously wanted harm to come to me because he gave Ellen suggested topics to include, has Scott ever abused his position of authority which was well outside of the scope of the bureau's internal investigation into me seven days after the order was issued at which Kief was sitting next to Ellen. The email where he says that's great news that the exculpatory information is being denied Scott. He didn't use the term exculpatory information, but that's what it was. Great news.

155 brought you back to CJIS? 1 2 A. Yes. Q. And you went back to work? 3 A. Yeah. 4 Did they inform you at that time that they 5 Q. 6 would be conducting an investigation? No, because it wasn't them who conducted the 7 Α. investigation. The protocol is for OPR to conduct an 8 9 investigation. 10 Did they inform you at that time that OPR would 11 be conducting an investigation? 12 Α. I don't know that they informed me of that, but 13 it was understood. 14 Q. Okay. Now I understand that about a week and a 15 half later, on September 26th, 2013, the FBI began its 16 internal investigation? 17 A. No. 18 Q. No? 19 The FBI delayed its internal investigation 20 until the resolution of the misdemeanor criminal charge. I invited them to and I asked them to, but their policy 21 22 is to not begin until... 23 Q. Regardless of when the FBI investigation began, 24 were you informed they were conducting an internal 25 investigation?

156 1 A. Yes. 2 Q. Who informed you? It may have been via letter. I don't know 3 precisely who informed me. 4 5 Q. That leads to my next question. After the 6 charges were dismissed in the Mon County Magistrate 7 Court in April of 2016, what then happened at the FBI? Then two agents came out to interview me. 8 A. This 9 may have been the first time I was official and formally 10 notified of the investigation. Although, I knew it was 11 And interviewed me about what happened. Were you still -- I take it you weren't put 12 ο. 13 back into your old position? 14 Correct. A. 15 You weren't given your gun or badge? Q. 16 A. Correct. That kind of leads to my next exhibit. 17 Q. 18 (Deposition Exhibit No. NO 34 was marked 19 for identification.) 20 Q. Mr. Ballock, Exhibit 34 is your signed sworn 21 statement that you gave to the FBI on June 29th, 2016. 22 Α. Yeah. 23 This is what you were just referring to? 24 A. Yeah. 25 Actually, I do have a question. At the top Q.

168 1 them. 2 Q. Attempted to serve them personally? I didn't know what the rules were for 3 A. service. 4 5 Q. When you filed the original complaint pro se, 6 you received a copy of the notice of general guidelines 7 for proceeding pro se? Α. Uh-huh. 8 9 Q. Did you read them? 10 A. Yes. 11 Q. So you were informed that, even though you were 12 proceeding pro se, you were bound by the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure. 13 14 Α. Yes. 15 Q. Were you aware that Rule 4 provides that as a 16 party to the action you are not permitted to conduct 17 service? 18 Α. No. I only attended law school for three 19 weeks. 20 Q. So who was the uniformed representative who 21 appeared at the resident agency? 22 Α. I don't know. I wish you guys would tell me. 23 To make sure that I'm clear, the resident 0. 24 agency is a different physical location and different --25 I guess within the organization chart, it's a completely

186 Again, you have alluded to this before, but in the top 1 paragraph there it talks about Agent Hamrick attended 2 the arrest proceeding. So he was there at family court 3 4 when you came out? A. Uh-huh. 5 Verbal answer. 6 Q. Yes. Sorry. Yes. 7 Α. Did he accompany you to magistrate court? 8 Q. I don't know. 9 Α. He was just there on behalf of the agency to 10 0. 11 observe? 12 A. Yes. There on the -- just under Item 5, under the 13 Q. bold heading it says, Special Agent -- "Senior 14 Supervisory Agent Ballock was rated at the excellent 15 level from 2012 to 2015." So this would include after 16 your arrest in 2013 and while the charges were pending 17 in 2014 and '15? 18 19 Α. Yes. I'm sorry? 20 Q. Yes. 21 A. And it goes on to say, "and he has earned two 22 Q. 23 cash awards." What is the basis for a cash award? It varies, doing a special assignment, going 24 A. above and beyond, getting -- starting new projects. 25